



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

## **Presentation II**

**11.15 – 12.45p.m.**

# **Programme Indicators and Evaluation**

## **IPA Workshop**

**March 24<sup>th</sup>**

**Kieran Moylan**



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

## Presentation Outline

- Evaluation
  - ex ante
  - Mid-term
  - Update evaluation
  - Ongoing evaluations
  - Ex post evaluation
- Performance Indicators
  - Experience from 2000 – 06 round
  - Innovations for the 2007 – 13 round



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

## **Ex-ante Evaluation**

## **EVALUATION**

- Under Article 41 of the General Regulation (1260/99) all OP's had to be subjected to an ex-ante evaluation.
- Such evaluation had to cover an ex-ante evaluation of:
  - social and economic situation
  - environmental situation
  - situation in terms of gender equality with regard to labour market opportunities and treatment at work
- verify the relevance of the implementation arrangements
- The ex-ante evaluations of all of the individual OP's was conducted in-house by the NDP/CSF Evaluation Unit



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly

*Investing in Your Future*

## **EVALUATION Cont'd**

### **Mid-Term Evaluation**

- Under Article 42 a mid-term evaluation of each OP, together with the CSF were undertaken during 2003
- Each of these evaluations was carried out by independent consultants commissioned by the Managing Authorities
- Core Terms of Reference were prepared by the central Evaluation Unit and covered such matters as:
  - examination of initial results of implementation
  - relevance and extent of attainment of targets
  - assessment of use made of financial resources & operation of monitoring and implementation systems
- Findings of evaluations considered by Monitoring Committees and their views transmitted to the Commission



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

# Purpose of Mid-Term Evaluation

“Provide an independent analysis of progress under the BMW Regional OP and developments in the programme environment to date and to make appropriate recommendations for programme adjustments on the basis of this analysis”

(Terms of Reference)



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly

*Investing in Your Future*

# Context for Mid-term Evaluation

- ❖ **All EU Programmes are reviewed at the mid-term point, covering:**
  - ❖ Progress to date
  - ❖ Changes in environment
  - ❖ Any adjustments needed?
  
- ❖ **Not fundamentally re-opening OP but reviewing implementation**
  
- ❖ **Evaluation feeds into BMW Assembly, OP Monitoring Committee and NDP Monitoring Committee**
  - ❖ Decisions on any adjustments by end-2003
  
- ❖ **Also a Mid-term Evaluation of overall NDP undertaken**
  - ❖ Reviews balanced regional development in the NDP



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



# TERMS OF REFERENCE

## **Task (1) Review Developments since The Mid-term Evaluation**

- MTE Recommendations, significant external developments

## **Task (2) Review Effectiveness/Progress to Date**

- Financial and physical indicators

## **Task (3) Programme Impact**

- Impact to date, likely impact

## **Task (4) Conclusions and Recommendations**

- Appropriate conclusions and recommendations, including for post 2006





*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

# Mid-Term Evaluation Award Criteria

1. Understanding, analysis and coverage of terms of reference;
2. Feasibility and adequacy of the methodological approach proposed;
3. Extent of relevant evaluation experience, and competencies in the areas/issues which are the subject of this evaluation; and
4. Cost of tender;
5. Resources allocated (this refers to the input, expertise and responsibilities of the persons employed on the evaluation).



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly

*Investing in Your Future*

# EVALUATION Cont'd

## *On-going Evaluations*

- In addition to the above formal evaluations required by Regulation, we in Ireland also undertook or commissioned a number of other on-going evaluations
- These on-going evaluations included sectoral evaluations covering a number of OP's (e.g. Roads Investment Programme), thematic evaluations again covering a number of OP's (e.g. in-company training), as well as evaluations of individual Measures (e.g. Childcare).
- These evaluations were either carried out directly by the Central Evaluation Unit, or were commissioned by the Unit, and were overseen by a Steering Committee involving representatives of all relevant Managing Authorities and Government Departments relating to the specific evaluation.



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

## EVALUATION Cont'd

### Ex-Post Evaluation

- Under Article 43 Ex-post evaluation is the responsibility of the Commission, in collaboration with the Member State and the Managing Authorities
- Must be completed within three years after the end of the programming period.
- Purpose is to examine the effectiveness and efficiency of the assistance and the impacts of the programmes
- Work on the ex-post evaluations of the 2000-2006 OP's is underway to date



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

## EVALUATION Cont'd

### Experience from 2000-2006 Round

- Very useful to have resource and expertise in central Evaluation Unit which could both directly undertake and commission evaluations, and provide assistance to Managing Authorities
- Having core terms of reference for the mid-term evaluations was advantageous and contributed to consistency and high standards, and facilitated overall CSF evaluation.
- Conducting the Mid-Term evaluation during 2003 was too early into the programming cycle, as in effect many of the measures were barely two years into implementation. This had the effect of skewing results.
- Mid –Term evaluation was very useful in undertaking a fundamental review in the way the Horizontal Principles were reported on and measured, which led to the prioritisation exercise being undertaken during the Review.
- The Mid-Term evaluation also assisted Managing Authorities and Intermediate Bodies in devising and populating a better suite of indicators



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

## EVALUATION Cont'd

### *Innovations for 2007-2013 Round*

- The system of evaluations have been somewhat simplified- while the legal obligation to undertake ex-ante and ex-post evaluations remain, there is no longer a Regulation requirement to undertake mid-term evaluations.
- In respect of the ex-ante evaluation, in duly justified cases, MS's may carry out one ex-ante covering a number of OP's under the Convergence Objective, and as of right under the Competitiveness & Employment Objective
- Instead of the mid-term evaluation, during the programming period MS's shall carry out evaluations linked to the monitoring of the OP, particularly where there are departures from the targets, or where revisions of OP's are being considered.
- Proportionality principle to apply to evaluation
- Ex-poste evaluations to be conducted by Commission per Objective per M.S.



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

# INDICATORS

## Indicators in 2000-2006 Programming Period

- Under Article 18 of Council Regulation (1260/1999) it was a requirement to have specific targets for each Priority, **quantified where they lend themselves to quantification**
- Also under Article 41.2 the ex-ante evaluation had to include an assessment of the indicators and targets selected in the OP's
- In the Regional OP's, because of the diversity of Measures contained within each Priority, each Measure had a suite of Output, Result and Impact indicators, quantified where possible, with base-line figures and mid-term and final targets
- For purposes of the Performance Reserve one indicator per Measure was selected as the 'Key Effectiveness Indicator'
- At Priority level, a number of selected Measure indicators were used as 'Proxy Indicators' (see attached extract from 2006 Annual Report)



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



**Border, Midland & Western  
Regional Assembly**

*Investing in Your Future*

| Priority Level Indicators         |                           |  |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------------|--|
| Priority                          | Indicator                 | Measurement  |
| Local Infrastructure              | Access                    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Number of kilometres improved under Non-National Roads</li><li>• % adults with Home Internet Access</li></ul>  |
| Local Enterprise                  | Employment                | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Net new jobs created in Tourism</li><li>• Net new jobs created in Micro-enterprise</li></ul>                   |
| Agriculture and Rural Development | Environment<br>Employment | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Water quality related to Agriculture</li><li>• Net new jobs created under Rural Development Measures</li></ul> |
| Social Inclusion and Childcare    | Social Inclusion          | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Net new Childcare places provided</li><li>• Long-term Unemployment Rate</li></ul>                              |



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programme 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



**Border, Midland & Western**  
**Regional Assembly**  
*Investing in Your Future*

| <b>Measure/sub-Measure</b>  | <b>Key Effectiveness Indicator</b>   |
|---|--|
| Measure: Non-national Roads Sub-Measure: EU Specific Improvements Scheme          | Km of roads improved/maintained  |
| Measure: Rural Water  | No. of persons benefiting from new/improved schemes  |
| Measure: Waste Management   | % of municipal waste disposed of to landfill & weight of biodegradable waste disposed of to landfill |
| Measure: Urban & Village Renewal  | No. of Projects Completed  |
| Measure: E-Commerce and Communications  | % adults with home internet access   |
| Measure: Tourism Sub-Measure: Major Attractors                                    | % Increase in no. of overseas visitors to major fee-paying attractions                               |
| Measure: Tourism Sub-Measure: Special Interest Pursuits                           | No. of overseas visitors engaged in Special Interest Activities                                      |
| Measure: Tourism Sub-Measure: Tourism/Environmental management                    | No. of integrated tourism management plans   |
| Measure: Micro-enterprise Sub-Measure: Selective Financial Intervention           | No. of net. new jobs created   |
| Measure: Micro-enterprise Sub-Measure: Entrepreneurial and Capability Development | No. of recipients of training  |
| Measure: Regional Innovation Strategies   | No. of Enterprises in Innovation Centres   |
| Measure: Forestry Sub-Measure: Woodland Improvement                               | Total no. of hectares grant-aided  |



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



**Border, Midland & Western**  
**Regional Assembly**  
*Investing in Your Future*

|  |   |
|--|---|
| Measure: Forestry Sub-Measure: Harvesting  | Environmentally sustainable harvesting systems as a % of grant-aided harvesting fleet |
| Measure : Fishery Harbours Gaeltacht/Islands Harbours Infrastructure Sub-Measure : Improvement Programme             | No of landing facilities upgraded/access improved                                     |
| Measure : Fishery Harbours Gaeltacht/Islands Harbours Infrastructure Sub-Measure : Aquaculture Development Programme | Value of Aquaculture output (€) for the Region  |
| Measure : General Structural Improvement (co-financed) Sub-Measure : Farm Waste Management                           | Number of Animals housed in grant aided facilities                                    |
| Measure : General Rrural Development Sub-Measure : Area Based Rural Development Initiative                           | Number of new full-time equivalent jobs created or existing jobs maintained           |
| Measure : Childcare Sub-Measure : Capital Grant Scheme   | Increase in number of childcare places  |
| Measure : Childcare Sub-Measure : Support for staffing costs   | Number of childcare workers supported   |
| Measure : Childcare Sub-Measure : Quality improvement programme  | Increase in number of trained childcare workers disaggregated by gender.              |
| Technical Assistance   | N/a   |



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly

*Investing in Your Future*

## **INDICATORS Cont'd**

### **Experience from 2000-2006 Round**

- Difficulties at outset of Programming in having Output, Result and Impact indicators devised for all Measures and to set quantifiable mid-term and final targets
- Because of the breadth of Measures, many of Priority indicators had to deploy measure indicators as proxy Priority indicators
- Lot of attention given to indicators in Mid-Term evaluation, particularly in reviewing final targets
- Problems of sourcing data for annual reporting on some of indicators
- Usual difficulties of establishing causality links between modest interventions and indicators chosen
- Most difficult to establish and measure impact indicators



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

## INDICATORS Cont'd

### Innovations for 2007-2013 Round

- Under Article 37.1(c) of Council Regulation 1083/2006 it is now mandatory to have specific targets for each Priority which must be quantified using a limited number of Output and Result Indicators.
- Impact indicators are encouraged but are not required by Regulation
- Proportionality Principle applies to indicators, with the advice given to have smaller number of better defined indicators
- Indicators are needed to track progress in relation to the baseline situation and the achievement of the Priority targets.
- As no longer have formal mid-term evaluation, not required to have mid-term targets
- For Annual Implementation Reporting, will also require some Programme level context indicators
- Attached is example of indicators selected for the S&E Regional OP, a small Objective 2 Programme of €146.6 million ERDF



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



*Border, Midland & Western*  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

# Performance Indicators 2007 - 2013



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



**Border, Midland & Western**  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

**Priority 1: Innovation, ICT and the Knowledge Economy**

| <b>Output:</b>   | <b>Final Target (2013)</b> |
|--|----------------------------|
| 1. No. of Regional Incubation Centres  | 9                          |
| 2. No. of collaborative research projects approved   | 4                          |
| 3. No. of training days provided to microenterprises                                       | 119,572                    |
| 4. No. of microenterprises supported   | 5,011                      |
| 5. No. of initiatives to enable broadband infrastructure and service provision             | 3                          |
| <b>Result:</b>   |                            |
| 1. Total employed in Incubation Centres  | 218                        |
| 2. No. of researchers engaged in the approved projects                                     | 100                        |
| 3. No. of enterprises in Incubation Centres  | 68                         |
| 4. No. of recipients of training   | 61,550                     |
| 5. No. of jobs created in assisted microenterprises  | 20,884                     |
| 6. Additional businesses with 512 Kbps downstream and 128Kbps upstream broadband available | 8,125                      |



Ireland's Central Fund  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



**Border, Midland & Western**  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

**Priority 2: Environment and Risk Prevention**

| <b>Output</b>  | <b>Final Target (2013)</b> |
|--|----------------------------|
| 1. No. of rural water source protection projects supported       | 12                         |
| 2. No. of STEDS projects supported                               | 12                         |
| 3. No. of energy schemes introduced                              | 8                          |
| <b>Result</b>  |                            |
| 1. Biological Oxygen Demand (BOD) Reduction in protected sources | 75%                        |
| 2. Population equivalent served by STEDS schemes                 | 2,800                      |
| 3. No. of energy efficient buildings supported                   | 492                        |
| 4. No. of Sustainable Development Zones                          | 4                          |



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



**Border, Midland & Western**  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

**Priority 3: Urban Development and Secondary Transport Networks**

| <b>Output</b>  | <b>Final Target (2013)</b>              |
|--|---|
| 1. No. of Integrated growth centre strategies approved | 10                                      |
| 2. No. of secondary linking routes improved            | 2                                       |
| 3. Km of improved linking routes                       | 14                                      |
| 3. No. of public transport projects supported          | 1                                       |
| <b>Result</b>  |   |
| 1. Timesavings on improved routes                      | 9.5 mins peak-time<br>2.7 mins off-peak |
| 2. Daily services on                                   | Dublin – Galway 10                      |
|  | Dublin – Westport 5                     |



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



**Border, Midland & Western**  
Regional Assembly  
*Investing in Your Future*

**Priority 4: Technical Assistance**

| <b>Output</b>                                      | <b>Final Target (2013)</b> |
|--|----------------------------|
| Number of Monitoring Committee Meetings held       | 7                          |
| 2. Number of Evaluations & Studies conducted       | 3                          |
| 3. Verification Audits & Closure audits            | 7                          |
| 4. Number of annual publicity events               | 7                          |
| <b>Result</b>                                      |                            |
| 1. % Achievement of Physical and Financial Targets | 100%                       |



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND



**Border, Midland & Western**  
**Regional Assembly**  
*Investing in Your Future*

| <b>Category</b> | <b>Indicator</b>                                    | <b>Baseline Value</b> | <b>Reference Year</b> | <b>Source</b>  |
|-----------------|---|-----------------------|-----------------------|--|
| Macro-economic  | GDP/Capita, Region (EU27=100)                       | 102.9                 | 2004                  | CSO (2007)   |
|                 | Total Employment in Region                          | 555,500               | 2006                  | CSO (2007)   |
|                 | Net Output per person Engaged in Industry in Region | €133,800              | 2004                  | CSO, Census of Industrial Production (2006)                              |
| Priority 1      | Innovation Activity Rate, Region                    | 50.8%                 | 2002-2004             | Forfás Innovation Survey (2006)  |
|                 | Entrepreneurial Activity Rate in Ireland            | 9.8%                  | 2005                  | National Competitiveness Council, Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (2006) |
|                 | % of Businesses with Broadband in Ireland           | 48%                   | 2003                  | National Competitiveness Council, Eurostat Info Society (2006)           |
| Priority 2      | Average Drinking Water Compliance Level in Region   | 95.6%                 | 2004                  | Environmental Protection Agency (2005)                                   |
|                 | Energy Efficiency in Building Stock in Ireland      | Tbd*                  | 2005                  | Sustainable Energy Ireland   |
| Priority 3      | Population of Gateways and Hubs                     | 215,288               | 2002                  | CSO, Census of Population (2004)   |
|                 | Public Transport Usage                              | Tbd*                  | 2005                  | Department of Transport  |



Ireland's EU Structural Funds  
Programmes 2007-2013

Co-funded by the Irish Government  
and the European Union



EUROPEAN REGIONAL  
DEVELOPMENT FUND